

Approximate Quadrature Measures on Data-Defined Spaces

H. N. Mhaskar

Claremont Graduate University

A very general quadrature theorem

(Tchakaloff, 1957)

Let \mathbb{X} be a compact topological space, $\{\phi_j\}_{j=0}^{N-1}$ be continuous real valued functions on \mathbb{X} , $\phi_0(x) \equiv 1$, and μ^* be a probability measure on \mathbb{X} (i.e., μ^* is a positive Borel measure with $\mu^*(\mathbb{X}) = 1$). Then there exist N points x_1, \dots, x_N , and **non-negative** numbers w_1, \dots, w_N such that

$$\sum_{k=1}^N w_k \phi_j(x_k) = \int_{\mathbb{X}} \phi_j(x) d\mu^*(x), \quad j = 0, \dots, N-1.$$

Exact quadrature

A consequence

Let $V_N = \text{span}\{\phi_0, \dots, \phi_{N-1}\}$. If $f \in C(\mathbb{X})$ then

$$\left| \int_{\mathbb{X}} f(x) d\mu^*(x) - \sum_{k=1}^N w_k f(x_k) \right| \leq 2 \min_{P \in V_N} \max_{x \in \mathbb{X}} |f(x) - P(x)|.$$

Approximate quadrature

Important variations

- ▶ The weights $w_k = 1/N$, $k = 0, \dots, N - 1$; wish to find points x_k (e.g., **Quasi-Monte Carlo (QMC) designs**).
- ▶ The points x_k are given (e.g., **machine learning**); wish to find the weights w_k .
- ▶ In either case, look for approximate quadrature rather than exact quadrature.

Goal of the current paper: Develop a unified theory.

A prototype : QMC Design sequence

Brauchart-Dick-Saff-Sloan-Wang-Womersley, 2015,

Brauchart-Saff-Sloan-Womersley, 2014

$q \geq 2$ integer, \mathbb{S}^q : unit sphere of \mathbb{R}^{q+1} , Δ^* : Laplace-Beltrami operator. For $r > 0$, $1 \leq p \leq \infty$,

$$W_r^p = \{f \in L^p(\mathbb{S}^q) : \|f\|_{W_r^p} = \|(1 - \Delta^*)^{r/2} f\|_{p, \mathbb{S}^q} < \infty\}.$$

For integer $n \geq 1$, let \mathcal{C}_n be a set of n points on \mathbb{S}^q . The sequence $\{\mathcal{C}_n\}$ is a **QMC design sequence** for W_r^p if

$$\left| \int_{\mathbb{S}^q} f(\mathbf{x}) d\mathbf{x} - \frac{1}{n} \sum_{\mathbf{y} \in \mathcal{C}_n} f(\mathbf{y}) \right| \leq \frac{c}{n^{r/q}} \|f\|_{W_r^p}, \quad f \in W_r^p.$$

A prototype : QMC Design sequence

- ▶ Every sequence of n -designs is a QMC design sequence for every W_r^p , $r > q/p$.
- ▶ If $\{\mathcal{C}_n\}$ is a QMC design sequence for W_r^1 , $r > q$, then

$$\delta_{\mathcal{C}_n} = \max_{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{S}^q} \min_{\mathbf{y} \in \mathcal{C}_n} d(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}) \sim n^{-1/q}.$$

(cf. Hesse-Mh.-Sloan, 2007)

- ▶ Let $K(t) = \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \hat{K}(\ell) p_{\ell}^{(q/2-1, q/2-1)}(1) p_{\ell}^{(q/2-1, q/2-1)}(t)$, $\hat{K}(\ell) \sim (1 + \ell)^{-2r}$, and $r > d/2$. If

$$\mathcal{C}_n^* = \{\mathbf{x}_1^*, \dots, \mathbf{x}_n^*\} = \arg \min \sum_{j,k=1}^n K(\mathbf{x}_j \cdot \mathbf{x}_k),$$

then $\{\mathcal{C}_n^*\}$ is a QMC design sequence of W_r^2 .

Machine learning problem

Given data of the form $\{(\mathbf{x}_j, y_j)\}_{j=1}^M$ drawn from an unknown probability distribution μ on $\mathbb{R}^D \times \mathbb{R}$, approximate $f(\mathbf{x}) = \mathbb{E}(y|\mathbf{x})$.

Main hurdles:

- ▶ D can be very large. (**remedy**: Try dimension-reduction.)
- ▶ The measure μ is not known; in particular, the set $\{\mathbf{x}_j\}$ is typically not dense enough on some cube in \mathbb{R}^D .
(**Theoretical**) **remedy**: Assume that the marginal distribution μ^* of \mathbf{x} is known; at least assume something about μ^* .)

Belkin-Niyogi, 2003, Coifman group, 2006–

Let μ^* be a probability measure supported on a locally compact, quasi-metric measure space \mathbb{X} , (ρ =quasi-metric), $\lambda_k \uparrow \infty$, $\{\phi_k\}$ sequence of orthonormal, continuous functions on \mathbb{X} . $\lambda_0 = 0$, $\phi_0 \equiv 1$.

Take the projection on

$$\Pi_n = \text{span}\{\phi_k : \lambda_k < n\},$$

$$\frac{1}{M} \sum_{k:\lambda_k < n} y_j \phi_k(\mathbf{x}_j),$$

as the estimator of $f(\mathbf{x}_j)$.

If \mathbb{X} is a compact manifold, one may take the eigenvectors and eigenvalues of a **diffusion matrix** as approximations of eigenfunctions and eigenvalues of the Laplace-Beltrami operator on \mathbb{X} . Belkin-Niyogi, 2004, 2007, 2008, Lafon, 2004, Singer, 2006, Rosasco-Belkin-De Vito, 2010, ...

Problem: Develop approximation theory in this context.

Data-defined spaces

The system $\Xi = (\mathbb{X}, \rho, \mu^*, \{\lambda_k\}_{k=0}^\infty, \{\phi_k\}_{k=0}^\infty)$ is called a **data-defined space (DDS)** if

- ▶ For each $x \in \mathbb{X}$ and $r > 0$, the ball $\mathbb{B}(x, r)$ is compact.
- ▶ There exists $q > 0$ and $\kappa_2 > 0$ such that

$$\mu^*(\mathbb{B}(x, r)) = \mu^*(\{y \in \mathbb{X} : \rho(x, y) < r\}) \leq \kappa_2 r^q, \quad x \in \mathbb{X}, r > 0.$$

- ▶ For $x, y \in \mathbb{X}$, $0 < t \leq 1$,

$$\left| \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \exp(-\lambda_k^2 t) \phi_k(x) \phi_k(y) \right| \leq \kappa_3 t^{-q/2} \exp\left(-\kappa_4 \frac{\rho(x, y)^2}{t}\right)$$

Remark \mathbb{S}^q is DDS, with $\{\lambda_k\}$, $\{\phi_k\}$ eigensystem of the Laplace-Beltrami operator.

Approximation on DDS

$$\Pi_n = \text{span}\{\phi_k : \lambda_k < n\}, \quad (\text{diffusion polynomials})$$

$$E_{n,p}(f) = \min_{P \in \Pi_n} \|f - P\|_p = \min_{P \in \Pi_n} \|f - P\|_{\mu^*; p, \mathbb{X}},$$

$$\hat{f}(k) = \int_{\mathbb{X}} f(y) \overline{\phi_k(y)} d\mu^*(y),$$

$$\Delta^r f \sim \sum_k (\lambda_k + 1)^r \hat{f}(k) \phi_k,$$

$$W_r^p = \{f \in L^p : \|f\|_{W_r^p} = \|f\|_p + \|\mathcal{D}^r f\|_p < \infty\},$$

$$\omega_s(p; f, \delta) = \inf_{f_1 \in W_s^p} \{\|f - f_1\|_p + \delta^s \|\Delta^s f_1\|_p\},$$

$$H_\gamma^p = \left\{ f \in L^p : \|f\|_{H_\gamma^p} = \|f\|_p + \sup_{0 < \delta < 1} \frac{\omega_s(f, \delta)}{\delta^\gamma} < \infty \right\},$$

some $s > \gamma$.

Approximation on DDS

Maggioni-Mh., 2008, Filbir-Mh., 2010

Let $X^p = \{f \in L^p : \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E_{n,p}(f) = 0\}$.

For $f \in X^p$

$$\|f\|_{H_\gamma^p} \sim \|f\|_p + \sup_{n \geq 1} n^\gamma E_{n,p}(f).$$

Remark $W_r^p \subsetneq H_r^p$ for all $r > 0$.

Approximate quadrature measures

Goal

For $W \subset L^p$,

$$\text{wor}(W, \nu) = \sup_{f \in W} \left| \int_{\mathbb{X}} f d\mu^* - \int_{\mathbb{X}} f d\nu \right|.$$

ν is typically supported on a finite subset of \mathbb{X} .

$$B(\gamma, p) = \{f \in H_\gamma^p : \|f\|_{H_\gamma^p} = 1\}.$$

- ▶ Allow ν to be a signed measure.
- ▶ Study measures ν_n for which $\text{wor}(B(\gamma, p), \nu_n) = \mathcal{O}(n^{-\gamma})$.

Approximate quadrature measures

Terminology

\mathcal{M} = set of all signed (or positive), complete, sigma finite, Borel measures on \mathbb{X} .

$|\nu|$ = Total variation measure for $\nu \in \mathcal{M}$.

ν is *d-regular* if

$$\|\nu\|_{\mathcal{R}(d)} = \sup_{x \in \mathbb{X}} d^{-q} |\nu|(\mathcal{B}(x, d)) < \infty.$$

ν is *quadrature measure of order n* if

$$\int_{\mathbb{X}} P d\mu^* = \int_{\mathbb{X}} P d\nu, \quad P \in \Pi_n.$$

Approximate quadrature measures

Terminology

A sequence $\mathfrak{N} = \{\nu_n\} \subset \mathcal{M}$ is a sequence of **approximate quadrature measures** ($\mathfrak{N} \in \mathcal{A}(\gamma, p)$) if

- ▶ $\sup_{n \geq 1} |\nu_n|(\mathbb{X}) < \infty$.
- ▶ $\sup_{x \in \mathbb{X}, n \geq 1} n^q |\nu_n|(\mathbb{B}(x, 1/n)) = \sup_{n \geq 1} \|\nu_n\|_{\mathcal{R}(1/n)} < \infty$.
- ▶

$$\sup_{n \geq 1} n^\gamma \text{wor}(B(\gamma, p) \cap \Pi_n, \nu_n) < \infty.$$

A measure ν is an approximate quadrature measure in $\mathcal{A}(\gamma, p, n)$ if it is the n -th term in a sequence of approximate quadrature measures.

Error in quadrature

Let $n \geq 1$, $1 \leq p \leq \infty$, $\gamma > q/p$, ν be a $1/n$ -regular measure satisfying $|\nu|(\mathbb{X}) < \infty$ and

$$\text{wor}(B(\gamma, p) \cap \Pi_n, \nu) \leq An^{-\gamma}.$$

Then for every $f \in H_\gamma^p$,

$$\left| \int_{\mathbb{X}} f d\mu^* - \int_{\mathbb{X}} f d\nu \right| \leq c \left(A + \|\nu\|_{R(1/n)}^{1/p} (|\nu|(\mathbb{X}))^{1/p'} \right) \frac{\|f\|_{H_\gamma^p}}{n^\gamma}.$$

Remarks

- ▶ If ν is a quadrature measure of order n , $\|\nu\|_{\mathcal{R}(1/n)} < \infty$, $|\nu|(\mathbb{X}) < \infty$ then $\text{wor}(B(\gamma, \rho), \nu) = \mathcal{O}(n^{-\gamma})$. (In particular, this holds if ν is a spherical n -design.)
- ▶ Under additional conditions, any positive quadrature measure of order n satisfies $|\nu|(\mathbb{X}) < \infty$, and $\|\nu\|_{\mathcal{R}(1/n)} < \infty$, and hence, $\text{wor}(B(\gamma, \rho), \nu) = \mathcal{O}(n^{-\gamma})$.
- ▶ If \mathbb{X} is a compact manifold, and $\{\lambda_k\}$, $\{\phi_k\}$ satisfy some technical conditions then for any finite $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathbb{X}$ with

$$\delta(\mathcal{C}) = \sup_{x \in \mathbb{X}} \min_{y \in \mathcal{C}} \rho(x, y) \leq c/n,$$

there is a positive (respectively, $1/n$ -regular) quadrature measure of order n supported on \mathcal{C} . [Filbir-Mh., 2010](#)

Let $\gamma > 0$ and $\mathfrak{N} \in \mathcal{A}(\gamma, \mathbf{1})$. Then there exist constants $c, C_1 > 0$ such that for $n \geq 1$,

$$|\nu|(\mathbb{B}(x, C_1/n)) \geq c/n^q, \quad x \in \mathbb{X}.$$

In particular, $\delta(\text{supp}(\nu)) \sim 1/n$.

Let $\gamma > 0$, $n > 0$, $1 \leq p \leq \infty$, and ν be a **positive** measure satisfying

$$\text{wor}(B(\gamma, p) \cap \Pi_n, \nu) \leq An^{-\gamma}.$$

Then (under some additional assumptions)

$$\nu(\mathbb{B}(x, 1/n)) \leq cn^{-q/p}, \quad x \in \mathbb{X}.$$

In particular, if $p = 1$, then $\nu \in \mathcal{A}(\gamma, 1, n)$.

Extremal problem

$G(x, y) \sim \sum_j b(\lambda_j) \phi_j(x) \overline{\phi_j(y)}$ is kernel of type β if $b(\lambda_j) \approx \lambda_j^{-\beta}$ in some technical sense. $\tilde{G}(x, y) \sim \sum_{j>0} b(\lambda_j) \phi_j(x) \overline{\phi_j(y)}$.
For $\nu \in \mathcal{M}$, $p' = p/(p-1)$,

$$\begin{aligned} M_p(\nu) &= \left\| \int_{\mathbb{X}} G(x, \circ) d\mu^*(x) - \int_{\mathbb{X}} G(x, \circ) d\nu(x) \right\|_{p'} \\ &= \left\| \int_{\mathbb{X}} \tilde{G}(x, \circ) d\nu(x) \right\|_{p'}. \end{aligned}$$

$K_n \subset \mathcal{M}$ is compact, $\sup_{\nu \in K_n} |\nu|(\mathbb{X}) < \infty$,
 $\sup_{\nu \in K_n} \|\nu\|_{\mathcal{R}(2^{-n})} < \infty$, and K_n contains a quadrature measure of order 2^n .

Extremal problem

Let $n \geq 0$, $\beta > q/p$, $0 < \gamma < \beta$, $\nu^\# \in K_n$, and

$$M_p(\nu^\#) \leq c \inf_{\nu \in K_n} M_p(\nu).$$

Then $\nu^\#$ is an approximate quadrature measure in $\mathcal{A}(\gamma, p, 2^n)$.
Remark $\nu^\#$ need not be an exact minimizer of $M_p(\nu)$.

Consequences

If $p = 2$, $G^*(x, y) = \sum_{j>0} b(\lambda_j)^2 \phi_j(x) \overline{\phi_j(y)}$,

$$M_2(\nu) = \int_{\mathbb{X}} \int_{\mathbb{X}} G^*(x, y) d\nu(x) d\nu(y).$$

If ν associates the mass $1/M$ with each element of a set $\{x_j\}_{j=1}^M$, then

$$M_2(\nu) = \frac{1}{M^2} \sum_{j=1}^M \sum_{k=1}^M G^*(x_j, x_k).$$

If K_n is the set of all such measures, and K_n contains a quadrature measure ν of order 2^n , then the minimizer of $M_2(\nu)$ is an approximate quadrature measure.

Generalized the result of Brautchart, Saff, Sloan, Womersley, 2014.

Consequences

Let \mathcal{C} be a fixed set of points with $\delta(\mathcal{C}) \leq c/n$ for sufficient small c so that there exists a positive quadrature measure supported on \mathcal{C} . We may choose \mathcal{K}_n to be the set of all probability measures supported on \mathcal{C} . **Only approximate minimization is required.**

If \mathbb{X} is compact, the dimension of Π_{2^n} is M , and K_n denotes the set of all probability measures supported on M -element subsets of \mathbb{X} , then we get a construction for an approximate version of Tchakaloff's theorem.

Key ingredients

Let $h : [0, \infty) \rightarrow [0, 1]$ be C^∞ , $h(t) = 1$ on $[0, 1/2]$, $h(t) = 0$ on $[1, \infty)$, and

$$\Phi_n(x, y) = \sum_k h\left(\frac{\lambda_k}{n}\right) \phi_k(x) \phi_k(y).$$

Then ([Maggioni-Mh., 2008](#), [Filbir-Mh. 2010](#)) for $S > q$,

$$|\Phi_n(x, y)| \leq \frac{cn^q}{\max(1, (n\rho(x, y))^S)}$$

Key ingredients

$$\sigma_n(f, x) = \int_{\mathbb{X}} \Phi_n(x, y) f(y) d\mu^*(y),$$

$$\tau_j(f, x) = \begin{cases} \sigma_1(f, x) & \text{if } j = 0, \\ \sigma_{2^j}(f, x) - \sigma_{2^{j-1}}(f, x), & \text{if } j = 1, 2, 3, \dots \end{cases}$$

If $f \in X^p$, then

$$f = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \tau_j(f)$$

and

$$\|f\|_{H_\gamma^p} \sim \|f\|_p + \sup_{j \geq 0} 2^{j\gamma} \|\tau_j(f)\|_p.$$

$$\|\tau_j(f)\|_{\nu;1} \leq (1 + (2^j d)^q)^{1/p} \|\nu\|_{R(d)}^{1/p} (|\nu|(\mathbb{X}))^{1/p'} \|\tau_j(f)\|_p.$$

Key ingredients

Product assumption (needed only for the sparsity statement) For $A, N > 0$, let

$$\epsilon_{A,N} := \sup_{\lambda_j, \lambda_k \leq N} \text{dist}(\infty; \phi_j \phi_k, \Pi_{AN}).$$

We assume that there exists $A^* \geq 2$ with the following property:
for **every** $R > 0$,

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} N^R \epsilon_{A^*, N} = 0.$$